

Chief Reporter Neil Smith's article opens with a classic fallacy: the Argument by Popularity. "48 organizations ...have concluded that Israel has committed genocide in Gaza," he trumpets, implying that 48 organizations cannot possibly be wrong. It's akin to a schoolboy's argument to his parents that every other boy in school has a cell phone, therefore cell phones must be good for kids! Ridiculous? Of course. Neil Smith follows up (without a pause) with another classic logical fallacy: the Argument by Authority. If Genocide Scholars, Médecins Sans Frontières, and the UN said so, it MUST be so. Compare this naïve assertion with one by our schoolboy who says that he could jump higher and be a basketball star if only his parents were to buy him those \$500 sneakers — Le Bron James, Shaquille O'Neill, and Magic Johnson said so in an ad he saw. Could these organizations be mistaken? And could these "authorities" be biased. Absolutely! Consider the fact that all of those "authorities," have failed to condemn Russia of genocide in Ukraine, China of genocide of the Yughurs, and the 400,000 killed in the Sudan whose army the US has charged with genocide. Only Israel draws the condemnation of Smith's authorities! Why is that? Could it be that they're antisemitic? And the ineluctable answer is YES.

What's missing in this article are facts. For example, the definition of genocide in Article II of the 1948 Genocide Convention: "Acts committed with intent to destroy... a national, ethnical, racial, or religious group." This definition certainly does not describe Israel. Should Israel have sought to destroy the population of Gaza, they would have simply carpet bombed the entire territory and ended the conflict in a week or two with no casualties among Israel's forces. Instead, Israel is the only country in the world to endanger its own troops by warning civilians of intended bombings. Rather this definition of genocide describes Hamas. Neil Smith needed only to consult [Hamas's founding Charter and decades of pronouncements by its leaders](#) to discover their passion to destroy not only Israel but all world Jewry. But Hamas, which started the Gaza War by its October 7th atrocities against Israeli civilians in their homes and at a music festival, is never even mentioned in Smith's article.

Hamas, which turns Gazan children into soldiers, doesn't exist in the Gaza War according to this Chief Reporter.

The Palestinians are, indeed, in a miserable situation because they are a stateless people. The blame for this condition lies NOT with Israel, but with their leadership which betrayed them by rejecting offers of a Palestinian

state not once, but 5 times: in 1937, 1947, 2000, 2008, 2020. But Neil Smith seems either incapable or unwilling to perform this elementary research.

Dr. Rosette Liberman, Pittsford, New York